Transparent Public Procurement Rating



Ukraine Public Procurement Legislation Assessment

The Assessment of the Public Procurement Legislation of Ukraine was prepared by Transparency International Ukraine (TI-Ukraine).

The Project – <u>Transparent Public Procurement Rating</u> – is implemented by the Institute for Development of Freedom of Information (IDFI) in Partnership with Transparency International Ukraine (TI-Ukraine), Transparency International Azerbaijan (TI-Azerbaijan), Expert-Grup (Moldova), Freedom of Information Center of Armenia (FOICA) and SYMPA/BIPART (Belarus).





Project is Financially Supported by the Open Society Institute Budapest Foundation (OSI)

The opinions expressed in this document belong to the Institute for Development of Freedom of Information (IDFI) and its partner organizations, and do not reflect the positions of Open Society Institute Budapest Foundation (OSI). Therefore, this organization is not responsible for the content of this report

Methodology

The TPPR Methodology is envisioned to be a universal methodology for assessing public procurement legislations (PPLs) with the ultimate goal of identifying the strengths and weaknesses of legal frameworks and their enforcement around the globe.

Structure and Logic

The Methodology is composed of 64 indicators, each of which holds a similar degree of importance. A number of these indicators are further broken down into scoring components.

The Methodology covers all the major components of any public procurement system, from the nature of the legislation to the complaint review process, with focus on the transparency of public procurement systems.

The selection of indicators for the Methodology was largely based on international best practice, international standards and aspects of other existing methodologies in the sphere of public procurement, such as:

- BRD Methodology and Standard
- GPA Standard (WTO)
- OECD Methodology and Principles
- EU Standard (Directive 2014/24/EU)
- Open Contracting Data Standard (OCDS)

Several indicators have been directly taken from one of the sources listed above as examples of best international practice. All of these indicators have been properly referenced.

During the indicator selection and elaboration process, an effort was made to ensure that the Methodology can be used to assess many different kinds of public procurement systems, but at the same time set high standards.

The indicators are separated into 5 groups (benchmark indicators) that represent the key characteristics (values) of a well-functioning, transparent and accountable public procurement system:

- 1. Uniformity of the Legislative Framework 14 indicators
- 2. Efficiency- 10 indicators
- 3. Transparency- 18 indicators
- 4. Accountability and Integrity-7 indicators
- 5. Competitiveness and Impartiality— 10 indicators

The methodology also includes 5 indicators that are used to assess legal components **that are not directly part** of the public procurement legislation but are crucial in terms of creating a transparent environment necessary for a proper functioning of any public procurement system. These indicators are grouped separately under **'Transparency Environment'**.

Indicators are also arranged according to the procurement process:

- 1. **Pre-tendering Phase** procurement processes leading up to the publication of a notice of intended procurement.
- 2. **Tendering Phase** procurement processes between publication of a notice of intended procurement and selection of a tender winner.
- 3. **Post-tendering Phase** procurement processes after the selection of a tender winner.

These two arrangements allow for both process and value-based assessments of public procurement legislations.

Limitations

Public procurement systems vary significantly by country. The TPPR Methodology is intended to be applicable on a global scale, meaning that the indicators cannot be too specific and cannot cover all the possible variations and exceptions.

For the same reason, the TPPR Methodology can only be used to assess public procurement legislations on the national level, and it does not include indicators for any industry specific rules.

Scoring System

Each indicator included in the TPPR Methodology is granted equal weight and receives a maximum of 1 point. With a total of 64 indicators, public procurement legislations are rated on the scale of **0 to 64** (converted to percentages for easier understanding and visualization).

Indicators that are further broken down into scoring components are nevertheless worth 1 point. Each scoring component is evaluated separately.

The Methodology uses two ways to distribute points among scoring components of an indicator:

- 1. **'Scoring method'** is used when scoring components of an indicator overlap (meaning they do not add up as points) or have an unequal distribution of points.
- 2. **'Point distribution'** is used when each scoring component of an indicator is given an equal share of the overall point granted to that indicator.

Terminology

This methodology uses universally accepted procurement terminology as well as a few terms of its own design, in order to make key distinctions easier.

Acceptance act– A document signed by parties through which they agree on the terms by which a bargain is concluded.

Bid – Price offered by a tender participant during the bidding procedure.

Bid Security – A refundable amount of money paid by tender candidates validating their participation in a tender.

Coordination – Providing assistance to economic operators and procuring entities to engage in procuring activities.

Day – In the context of this methodology a day implies a calendar day.

Economic Operator – business or other organization which supplies goods, works or services.

Legal entity of public law (LEPL) (Public Legal Entity) – Organization created by the government or a government body, but separated from state management, and performing public authority independent of state control.

Machine-readable – A data format that can be processed (i.e. extract, read, transform) by a computer.

Monitoring – Data collection and analysis.

State non-commercial legal entity – A body governed by public law, having legal personality, not having an industrial or commercial character, and funded or managed, for the most part, by state entities.

Non-competitive procedure (direct procurement) – A type of public procurement procedure that does not involve prior publication of a notice of intended procurement.

Notice of intended procurement – A call for participation in an open tender issued by procuring entities.

Open tender – A type of tender, in which any economic operator can request participation.

Post-tendering phase – procurement processes after the selection of a tender winner.

Pre-tendering phase – procurement processes leading up to the publication of a notice of intended procurement.

Procurement regulatory body – a state body responsible for managing the public procurement system without necessarily incorporating lawmaking and law enforcement functions.

Procuring entity – A state budget and local government entity (including their respective LEPLs, state owned companies and non-commercial legal entities).

Public procurement annual plan – A document issued by procuring entities that contains information about all procurements planned within a fiscal year.

Tender – A type of public procurement procedure that involves bidding.

Tender application – An economic operator's official request to participate in a tender that includes all the documents requested by the procuring entity.

Tender candidate – An economic operator willing to participate in a tender.

Tender commission – A group of persons within a procuring entity responsible for conducting procurement (this function can also be performed by a single person).

Tender documentation – A collection of documents containing full information about the procurement, such as its subject-matter, technical requirements/specification, eligibility and evaluation criteria, draft contract conditions etc.

Tender participant – An economic operator that has been allowed to participate in a tender.

Tendering phase – procurement processes between publication of a notice of intended procurement and selection of a tender winner.



Ukraine

2016	2017	2018	2019	ionnaire: 2020
Please sele	ct which ye	ears the eva	luation is	applicable to:
2016	2017	2018	2019	2020
			✓	
Exam	nple: If you a	re filling in t	the question	nnaire in 2020 and public procurement legislation has not been
chan	ged in your	country for t	the last 4 ye	ears, you should put '2020' in the 'year of feeling in the
quest	tionnaire" ar	nd select the	years 2016	5, 2017, 2018, 2019 and 2020 in the 'years the evaluation is
		us identifying	g that the f	illed in information is applicable to the current as well as the
previ	ous years.			
			Tra	nsparency Environment
Business	registry is p	oublicly ava	ilable. – [1	point].
coring Metho	od			
Yes				
No				
				This indicator point: 1
	le 11 of Law o nizations".	of Ukraine "Or	n state regist	ration of legal entities, physical persons-entrepreneurs and non- governmental
		Delete comment	:	
Dudost	ناط بدر الد	o progueira -	antitios s	o publich available - [1 point]
	-	c procuring	entities ar	e publicly available. – [1 point].
coring Meth	-	c procuring	entities ar	e publicly available. – [1 point].
	-	c procuring	entities ar	e publicly available. – [1 point].
coring Metho	-	c procuring		e publicly available. – [1 point]. This indicator point: 1

YesNo		
	This indicator point: 1	
	Article 45 of Law of Ukraine "On prevention of corruption". Edit comment Delete comment	
		//
		•
	This indicator point: 1	
	Law of Ukraine "On access to public information". Edit comment Delete comment	
		//
		//
	gislation includes provisions regulating whistleblower protection. – [1 point].	//
	g Method	//

Chapter 8 of Law of Ukraine "On prevention of corruption".

Delete comment

Edit comment

General Characteristics	
6 Public Procurement Legislation (PPL), which may include primary and secondary legislation, lays out the basic principles and general framework of the procurement process, makes it operational and indicates how the law must be applied to specific circumstances. – [1 point].	
Scoring Method	
O Yes	
○ No	
This indicator point: 1	
1. Law of Ukraine "On Public procurement" – further PPL. 2. 2 dedicated Government Decrees and 7 specific Orders of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine (Authorized body on PP regulation).	
	//
7 PPL (including primary and secondary legislation) is available in a single and accessible place. – [1 point].	
Scoring Method	
○ None – [0]	
Only on paper – [0.25]	
 Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] 	
Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1]	
This indicator point: 1	
www.me.gov.ua www.rada.gov.ua	
Edit comment Delete comment	

PPL applies to all state budget and local government entities (including their respective Legal Entities of Public Law (LEPLs), state owned companies and non-commercial legal entities) and all exempted entities are clearly indicated. – [1 point .
Point Distribution
 ✓ a) All state budget entities – [0.2] ✓ b) Local government entities – [0.2] ✓ c) Legal Entities of Public Law (LEPL) – [0.2] ✓ d) State owned companies – [0.2] ✓ e) State non-commercial legal entities – [0.2]
This indicator point: 1
Point 9 of article 1 of PPL. Edit comment Delete comment
The scope of coverage of PPL includes all sectors of the economy where competition is possible and exemptions are clearly listed in the PPL. – [1 point].
Point Distribution
 a) The scope of coverage of PPL includes all sectors of the economy where competition is possible - [0.5] b) PPL clearly lists or refers to all exemptions – [0.5]
This indicator point: 1
Art.2 of PPL, incl. list of exemptions in point 3 of this article. Edit comment Delete comment
PPL determines a separate state body (procurement regulatory body) responsible for managing public procurement or assigns this function to a subordinate public body(ies). – [1 point].
Scoring Method
 PPL determines a separate state body responsible for managing public procurement which is authorized to have income in addition to state funding – [1]
 PPL determines a separate state body responsible for managing public procurement – [0.75] PPL assigns this function to a subordinated public body(ies) – [0.5] There is no responsible state body – [0]
This indicator point: 0.75
Point 34 of art.1 of PPL. Government Decree #459 from 20.08.2014.

Edit comment Delete comment

Scoring Method Yes No	
	This indicator point: 1
Point 1 of artic	e 8 of PPL.
Edit comment	Delete comment
edback and identify rocurement to use t	des for a mechanism of consultation with the private and civil society sectors that is aimed at receiving problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point].
eedback and identify rocurement to use to Point Distribution	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point].
eedback and identify rocurement to use to a point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If for a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If for a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25]
eedback and identify rocurement to use to a point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point].
eedback and identify rocurement to use to a point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If for a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If for a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25]
redback and identify rocurement to use to a point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide PPL obligates the e	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If for a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If for a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5]
redback and identify rocurement to use to a point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide PPL obligates the e	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If or a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If or a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5] This indicator point: 0.5
Point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide PPL obligates the e	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If or a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If or a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5] This indicator point: 0.5
Point Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide PPL obligates the e	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If or a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If or a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5] This indicator point: 0.5
edback and identify cocurement to use to every count Distribution Legislation provide Legislation provide PPL obligates the e	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If or a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If or a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5] This indicator point: 0.5
Point 8 of artic	ring problems in the procurement system. PPL obligates the entity responsible for managing public his mechanism on a regular basis. – [1 point]. If or a mechanism of consultation with the private sector – [0.25] If or a mechanism of consultation with the civil society sector – [0.25] Intity responsible for managing public procurement to use this mechanism on a regular basis – [0.5] This indicator point: 0.5

✓ PPL stipulates that electronic means is the primary method of conducting public procurement – [0.5]

PPL stipulates that electronic means is the primary method of communication between procuring entities and tender participants – [0.5]

Point Distribution

	Point 2 of article	e12 and point 1 of article 14 of PPL.
	Edit comment	Delete comment
	PL establishes a ement. – [1 poi	single official point of access (i.e. an online portal) for all procedures and information related to public nt].
-	Method	
Yes		
O No		
		This indicator point: 1
		This indicator point. I
	Article 10 of PP	
	Edit comment	Delete comment
discrim	inatory, free to	res that software used for electronic procurement and related communication shall be non- use and interoperable with the ICT products in general use and shall not restrict economic operators' ment procedure. – [1 point].
Scoring	Method	
O Yes		
O No		
		This indicator point: 1
	Doint 2 -f - 41 1	12 of DDI
	Point 3 of article	Delete comment
	cuit comment	

	PPL ensures that tender candidates must be given equal treatment, without regard to nationality, residency or political 🕏 🛧 ation: – [1 point].
Poin	t Distribution
✓ F ✓ E	PPL should not allow domestic preferences – [1 5] Participation of any candidate or group of candidates is based on qualification – [1 5] Ensures that registration if required does not constitute a barrier to participation in tenders – [1 5] State owned companies are not given any preference – [1 5] Time-periods, including any extension of the time-periods, shall be the same for all interested or participating candidates – [1 5]
	This indicator point: 1
	Article 5 of PPL. Point 4 of article 22 of PPL.
	Edit comment Delete comment
	PPL stipulates that a procuring entity shall, consistent with its own reasonable needs, provide sufficient time (based on
the G	SPA standard - Article XI) for candidates to prepare and submit tender application. – [1 point].
Scor	ing Method
O \	
	No
	This indicator point: 1
	Point 3 of art.21 of PPL.
	Edit comment Delete comment
18	PPL stipulates that each procuring entity has a staff member(s) responsible for conducting procurement activities. – [1
point	
Scor	ing Method
O \	⁄es
	No
	This indicator point: 1
	This indicator point.
	Article 11 of PPL.
	Edit comment Delete comment

This indicator point: 1

	//
22 PPL ensures the right to review throughout the procurement process. – [1 point].	^
Point Distribution	
 ✓ Complaints can be filed at any time during the procurement process up until the signing of the contract – [1 3] ✓ A procurement contract cannot be awarded with a pending complaint – [1 3] 	
A reasonable amount of time should be left between publication of the contract award decision and the signing of the contract, in order to give any stakeholder the opportunity to challenge the award decision – [1 3]	,
This indicator point: 1	
Point 2 of art.18 of PPL.	
Edit comment Delete comment	
	//
23 PPL ensures the existence of an independent (from parties involved in a procurement dispute) review body with the authority to review complaints and grant remedies. – [1 point].	^
Point Distribution	
PPL ensures the existence of an independent review body – [0.7]	
☐ The review body includes civil society members — [0.3]	
This indicator point: 0.7	
Point 3 of art. 8 of PPL.	
Edit comment Delete comment	
	/,
24 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to submitted complaints, either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].	^

Point 27 of article 1 of PPL, Art. 18 of PPL (last indent of point 2, point 12), Article 55 of Constitution of Ukraine Civil Procedural Code of

Ukraine Economic Procedural Code of Ukraine.

Delete comment

Edit comment

Scoring Method

 Electronic, machine-readable, free of chard Electronic, machine-readable, not free of chard Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Only on paper – [0.25] None – [0] 	charge – [0.75]	
	This indicator point: 1	
Point 1 of art.18 of PPL.		
Edit comment Delete comment		
		//
	adable and free of charge access to dispute resolutions (of the independent review tion contained in these documents. – [1 point].	•
Scoring Method Electronic, machine-readable, free of characteristics.	ge = [1]	
Electronic, machine-readable, not free of	charge – [0.75]	
Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5]Only on paper – [0.25]None – [0]		
	This indicator point: 1	
Point 11 of art.18 of PPL. Edit comment Delete comment		
		//
	Pre-Tendering Phase	
5 .	publish as early as possible in each fiscal year a notice regarding their future annual plan". The annual plan must include at least: – [1 point].	•
Point Distribution		
-	assificatory system) of planned procurements – [0.25] quarter) of publication of the notices of intended procurement – [0.25]]	
	This indicator point: 1	

27 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to public procurement annual plans of all procuring entities or key information included in these documents. – [1 point].

Scoring Method

- O Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge [1]
- Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge [0.75]
- Electronic, non-machine-readable [0.5]
- Only on paper [0.25]
- None [0]

This indicator point: 1

Art. 4 of PPL.

Edit comment Delete comment

Legislation stipulates that the planning of procurement and estimation of associated expenditures are part of the state budget formulation process in a fiscal year. – [1 point].

Scoring Method

Yes

O No

This indicator point: 1

Budget Code of Ukraine, in particularly art.2.

Edit comment

Delete comment

29 PPL stipulates that procurement process should not normally be initiated until the appropriate financial resources have been identified (Including budgetary as well as non-budgetary resources e.g. grants, credits by international organizations, investment funds received under state guarantees, funds from state-owned enterprises, etc.). – [1 point].

Yes No	
	This indicator point: 1
	Point 1 of article 19, point 1 of article 23, articles 32-36 of Budget Code of Ukraine.
	Edit comment Delete comment
۲ ed ۱	PL defines the composition, powers, responsibilities and decision-making procedures of the body (tender commissio rson) responsible for conducting tender within the procuring entity. – [1 point].
oring Yes	
pe oring Yes	rson) responsible for conducting tender within the procuring entity. – [1 point]. g Method
pe oring Yes	rson) responsible for conducting tender within the procuring entity. – [1 point].
pe oring Yes	rson) responsible for conducting tender within the procuring entity. – [1 point]. g Method This indicator point: 1
pe oring Yes	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
pe oring Yes	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
oring Yes	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
oring Yes	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
а ре	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
oring Yes	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.
a pe	This indicator point: 1 Art.11 of PPL, dedicated detailed Order of MEDTA of Ukraine No557 from 30.03.2016.

O Yes O No

This indicator point: 1

Point 1 of article 2 of PPL.

Edit comment

Delete comment

	ipulates that open tender is the default procedure for any public procurement, and all exceptions are clearly listed \wedge – [1 point].
Point Distril	bution
	nder is the default procedure for any public procurement – [0.5] otions are clearly listed by the PPL – [0.5]
	This indicator point: 1
Poii	nt 1 of article 20 of PPL. Points 3 and 4 of article 2 of PPL.
Edit	comment Delete comment
22 PPL 4	
point].	ipulates that justification for using a non-competitive procedure must be made public by the procuring entity. – [1 🔨
Scoring Met Yes	hod
O No	
	This indicator point: 1
Poi	nt 3 of article 35 of PPL.
Edit	comment Delete comment
or in a man	ipulates that provided that it does not use this provision for the purpose of avoiding competition among suppliers ner that discriminates against foreign suppliers or protects domestic suppliers, a procuring entity may use non- e procedure (direct procurement) when: – [1 point].
Scoring Met	hod
If there	conditions given below are satisfied - [1] are other exceptions – [0.5] the above – [0]
	This indicator point: 1
	a) Where the goods or services can be supplied only by a particular supplier and no reasonable alternative or substitute goods or services exist.
	b) For additional deliveries by the original supplier of goods or services that were not included in the initial
	procurement where a change of supplier for such additional goods or services cannot be made for economic or technical reasons such as requirements of interchangeability or interoperability with existing equipment,
	software, services or installations procured under the initial procurement; or would cause significant

inconvenience or substantial duplication of costs for the procuring entity.

- c) Insofar as is strictly necessary where, for reasons of extreme urgency brought about by events unforeseeable by the procuring entity, the goods or services could not be obtained in time using open tendering or selective tendering.
- d) Where a procuring entity procures a prototype or a first good or service that is developed at its request in the course of, and for, a particular contract for research, experiment, study or original development.
- e) For purchases made under exceptionally advantageous conditions that only arise in the very short term in the case of unusual disposals such as those arising from liquidation, receivership or bankruptcy, but not for routine purchases from regular suppliers.

Point 2 of art.35 of PPL.

Edit comment

Delete comment

Tendering Phase

35 PPL stipulates that the notice of intended procurement/tender documentation must include at least: – [1 point].

Point Distribution

- ✓ Name and address of the procuring entity and other information necessary to contact the procuring entity and obtain all relevant documents relating to the procurement, and their cost and terms of payment, if any [1|8]
- A description of the procurement, including the nature and the quantity of the goods or services (including construction) to be procured or, where the quantity is not known, the estimated quantity [1|8]
- ✓ CPV codes (or other classificatory system of a similar nature) [1|8]
- ☑ Estimated value of the goods or services to be procured [1|8]
- ✓ The time-frame for delivery of goods or services or the duration of the contract [1|8]
- ✓ The procurement method that will be used [1|8]
- ☑ The address (where applicable) and any final date for the submission of requests for participation in the procurement [1|8]
- ✓ A list and brief description of any conditions (eligibility criteria) for participation of candidates, including any requirements for specific documents or certifications to be provided by candidates in connection therewith [1|8]

This indicator point: 1

Point 1 of art.21, point 2 of art.22 of PPL.

Edit comment

Delete comment

/

36 PPL stipulates that the notice of intended procurement/tender documentation must include: – [1 point].

Point Distribution

- ✓ Payment conditions [0.2]
- ☑ Information about bid security (if required) [0.2]
- Source of funding [0.2]
- ✓ Payment information for multi-year contracts [0.2]

Distribution pabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] pancial position – [1 3] pounds of restriction for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1	PPL defines all eligibility criteria for participation in tender that must include at least: – [1 point]. Distribution apabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] analysis of restriction for participation – [1 3]	PPL defines all eligibility criteria for participation in tender that must include at least: – [1 point]. Distribution spabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] nancial position – [1 3] ounds of restriction for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1 Point 2 of art.16 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.		This indicator point: 1
Distribution pabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] pancial position – [1 3] pounds of restriction for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1	Distribution apabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] nancial position – [1 3] rounds of restriction for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1 Point 2 of art.16 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.	Distribution apabilities with the respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] anancial position – [1 3] rounds of restriction for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1 Point 2 of art.16 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.		-
	Point 2 of art.16 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.	Point 2 of art.16 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.		
	·	·	istribution abilities with the ancial position –	respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] [1 3] on for participation – [1 3]
			Distribution apabilities with the nancial position – rounds of restriction	respect to personnel, equipment, and construction or manufacturing facilities – [1 3] [1 3] on for participation – [1 3] This indicator point: 1 of PPL (inc. financial position) Points 1 and 2 of art.17 of PPL.

defined by the national legislation). – [1 point].

Point Distribution

- PPL stipulates that procuring entities may seek consultations for the purpose of planning procurement from independent experts or market participants – [0.5]
- PPL prohibits these experts or market participants from taking part or benefiting from tenders they helped plan, unless it can be demonstrated that there is no conflict of interest (as defined by the national legislation) – [0.5]

This indicator point: 1

Point 8 of article 9 and point 4 of article 4 of PPL. .

Edit comment

Delete comment

39 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to notices of intended procurement (including tender documentation), either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].	^
Scoring Method	
 Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1] Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Only on paper – [0.25] None – [0] 	
This indicator point: 1	
Points 1 and 5 of article10 of PPL.	
Edit comment Delete comment	
	//
40 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to tender documentation amendments, either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].	^
Scoring Method	
 Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1] Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Only on paper – [0.25] None – [0] 	
This indicator point: 1	
Doints 1 (indept 2) and E of out 10 of DDI	
Points 1 (indent 3) and 5 of art.10 of PPL. Edit comment Delete comment	
Edit Comment Delete Comment	
	//
41 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to tender candidate applications (all documents needed for the request to participate in a tender), either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].	^
Scoring Method	
Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1]	
Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75]	
○ Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5]	
○ Only on paper – [0.25]○ None – [0]	

Point 1 of art.14	of PPL.
Edit comment	Delete comment
2 PPL ensures electarticipant. – [1 point	tronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to information about the bids offered by tender].
Scoring Method	
Electronic, machine-r	readable, free of charge – [1]
Electronic, machine-r	eadable, not free of charge – [0.75]
Electronic, non-mach	
○ Only on paper – [0.2○ None – [0]	5]
None – [0]	
	This indicator point: 1
Article 27 of the	PPL.
Edit comment	Delete comment
	tronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to decisions of the tender commission, either the fuln n contained in these documents. – [1 point].
-	restrained in these documents. [I point].
Scoring Method	
	readable, free of charge – [1]
Only on paper – [0.2	
None – [0]	
	This indicator point: 1
	This indicator point. I
Points 1 and 5 o	fart.10 of PPL.
Edit comment	Delete comment
Electronic, non-machOnly on paper – [0.2None – [0]Points 1 and 5 or	This indicator point: 1 f art.10 of PPL.

Scoring Method	
YesNo	
Yes	This indicator point: 1
Sub-point 3 of point 2 of art.22 of PPL	
Edit comment Delete comment	
·	
	This indicator point: 1
Art.24 of PPL.	
Edit comment Delete comment	
Edit comment Delete comment Delete comment Delete comment	
46 Legislation explicitly defines conflict Point Distribution ✓ The concept of conflicts of interest covers a provider acting on behalf of the procuring	
46 Legislation explicitly defines conflict Point Distribution ✓ The concept of conflicts of interest covers a provider acting on behalf of the procuring outcome of that procedure, have, directly compromise their impartiality and independent.	t of interest and includes mechanisms for its prevention: – [1 point]. at least any situation where staff members of the procuring entity or of a procurement service entity who are involved in the conduct of the procurement procedure or may influence the

otherwise – [1|3]

Edit com	0	of PPL Art.28 of Law	of Ukraine "On _I	prevention of	corruption .				
	ment	Delete comment							
•		at award decision In the tender docui		•	n the basis o	f evaluatio	n criteria th	at have beer	n precisely
Scoring Method									
Yes									
O No									
			This indi	cator point: 1	1				
Point 1	5 of art	and art. 28 of PPL.							
Edit com		Delete comment							
		at upon modificat							
ompletion of		at upon modificat application submi							
ompletion of oint].	tender								
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution	tender								
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende	tender on on er candida on al adec	application submi	ission period,	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition	tender on on er candida on al adec	application submi tes; and – [0.5]	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition	tender on on er candida on al adec	application submi tes; and – [0.5]	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition application	tender and	application submi tes; and – [0.5] uate time (either by	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition application	tender on on er candida onal adec on of art.23	application submi tes; and – [0.5] uate time (either by	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition application	tender on on er candida onal adec on of art.23	application submites; and – [0.5] uate time (either by of PPL.	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition application	tender on on er candida onal adec on of art.23	application submites; and – [0.5] uate time (either by of PPL.	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1
ompletion of oint]. Point Distribution To all tende Give addition Application	tender on on er candida onal adec on of art.23	application submites; and – [0.5] uate time (either by of PPL.	ission period, extending or re	a procuring	g entity shall	transmit ir	writing all	such modifi	cations: – [1

Scoring Method	
O Yes	
○ No	
the tender, including failure to do so, as soon as it is made, but no later than the end of the following w. Scoring Method Yes No This indicator point: 1 Point 1 of art.32 of PPL. Edit comment Delete comment Delete comment Delete comment Scoring Method a) In order to participate in a tender, interested parties have to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is not obliged to either inform interested parties can participate in a tender without the need of referring beforehand, but the entity is not obliged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids, or interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids to l.). b) In order to participate in a tender interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids [0]. b) In order to participate in a tender interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be only it is obliged to inform those who made it to be bidding stage of the reasons for rejecting bids [0]. c) In order to participate in a tender interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform those who made it to be bidding stage of the reasons for rejecting bids [0]. c) In order to participate in a tender interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform those who made it to be bidding stage of the reasons for rejecting bids [0]. c) In order to participate in a tender interested parties need to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting entity with relevant requests be entity is obliged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids entity is obliged to inform those who made it to be bidding stage of	This indicator point: 1
the tender, including failure to do so, as soon as it is made, but no later than the end of the following working day]. Scoring Method Yes No This indicator point: 1 Point 1 of art.32 of PPL. Edit comment Delete comment Delete comment Scoring Method a) In order to participate in a tender, interested parties have to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests beforehand an entity is not obliged to either inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting peduests nor to inform those who made it to stage of the reasons for rejecting bids; or interested parties can participate in a tender without the need of referring to a procur	of PPI
50 According to PP	L legislation: _ [1 point]
•	Liegisiation. – [i point].
	nate in a tender interested parties have to refer to a procuring entity with relevant requests beforehand and the procuring
·	
,	
beforehand, but the	entity is not obliged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids [0].
·	
, ,	
5 5	
·	
the reasons for rejec	cting bids; or interested parties can participate in a tender without the need of referring to a procuring entity beforehand
and the entity is obl	iged to inform interested parties of the reasons for rejecting bids – [1]
	This indicator point: 1
Points 2 and 3 o	of art.30 of PPL. Point 1 (2 indent) of art.32 of PPL.
-	at in cases when evaluation criteria include both price and quality, the winner shall be chosen using a broach, such as: – [1 point].
Point Distribution	
Life-cycle cost – [1	
Best price-quality ra	·
Environmental and	or social costs – [1 3]
	This indicator point: 1

Subpo Edit com	nt 4 of point 1 of article 1, point 3 of article 29 of PPL. ment Delete comment
	Post-Tendering Phase
•	ulates that upon successful conclusion of tender (upon choosing and announcing of the winner) the following ust be made public as soon as it is available: – [1 point].
Point Distributi	on
where diffe	rent, of the service from which additional information may be obtained – [0.1]
	orocurement – [0.1] (or other classificatory system of similar nature) – [0.1]
Description	of the procurement: nature, extent, quantity or value of goods, works and services. Where the contract is divided into lots, this shall be provided for each lot – [0.1]
☑ Date of the	ard procedure; in the case of negotiated procedure without prior publication, justification – [0.1] signing of contract(s) or of framework agreement(s) – [0.1]
	the contract – [0.1]
_	bids and their respective amounts received – [0.1] ress, telephone, fax number (where applicable), email address and internet address of the successful tender participant(s) including
	whether the contract was awarded to a group of economic operators (joint venture, consortium or other) (where applicable) – [
deadline fo	address of the body responsible for review and, where appropriate, mediation procedures. Precise information concerning the r review procedures, or if need be, the name, address, telephone number, fax number (where applicable) and email address of the n which this information may be obtained – [0.1]
	This indicator point: 1
	subpoint 4 of point 2 of article 22, article 23 of PPL. MEDTA Order #490 MEDTA Order #490 Art.19 of PPL Point 1 of art.10, Art.19 MEDTA Order #490.
Edit com	

PPL stipulates that the information on subcontractors must be made public upon successful conclusion of tender (upon choosing and announcing of the winner). – [1 point].

Point Distribution

- ✓ Procurement contracts include information on what proportion of the contract can be subcontracted to third parties [0.5]
- ☑ Information on subcontractors (if any): name, address, ID, contact information, is made public as soon as this information is available [0.5]

This indicator point: 1

Point 1 of art.19	19 of PPL.	
Edit comment	Delete comment	
	ectronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to procurement ced in these documents. – [1 point].	contracts, either the full text or key 🔨
Scoring Method		
Electronic, machine	e-readable, free of charge – [1] e-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] achine-readable – [0.5] 0.25]	
	This indicator point: 0.5	
Point 1 of art. 1 Edit comment	10 of PPL (it requires to publish all contracts but they are published as scanned, n Delete comment	not machine-readable).

PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to contract amendments, either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].

Scoring Method

- O Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge [1]
- Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge [0.75]
- Electronic, non-machine-readable [0.5]
- Only on paper [0.25]
- None [0]

This indicator point: 1

Point 1 of art.10 (relevant key info is published in form of separate report).

Edit comment

Delete comment

56 and	PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to contract performance information (acceptance act milestone reports), either the full text or key information included in these documents. – [1 point].
Sco	oring Method
	Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1] Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Only on paper – [0.25] None – [0]
	This indicator point: 1
	Point 1 of art.10 (relevant key info is published in form of separate report).
	Edit comment Delete comment
57 info	PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to payment receipts, either the full text or key rmation contained in these documents. – [1 point].
Sco	oring Method
	Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge – [1] Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge – [0.75] Electronic, non-machine-readable – [0.5] Only on paper – [0.25] None – [0]
	This indicator point: 1
	Art. 3 of Law of Ukraine "On openness of use of public funds".
	Edit comment Delete comment
58	PPL clearly defines the procedures for inspection and quality control procedures: – [1 point].
Ро	int Distribution
✓✓	Quality control (QC) procedures for goods, works and services are well defined in the draft contracts, documents or in the regulations – [0.5] Inspection of civil works is carried out by independent engineering firms or qualified government supervisors and inspectors – [0.5]
	This indicator point: 1
	Regulated by Civil and Business Codes and Government Decree #668 from 01.08.2005 (for civil works).

Edit comment Delete comment

59 PPL ensures electronic, machine-readable and free of charge access to any inspection and quality control reports, either the full text or key information contained in these documents. – [1 point].	^
Scoring Mathod	

Scoring Method

- O Electronic, machine-readable, free of charge [1]
- ☐ Electronic, machine-readable, not free of charge [0.75]
- Electronic, non-machine-readable [0.5]
- Only on paper [0.25]
- None [0]

This indicator point: 1

Points 3,6,9,18 of article 7-1 of PPL.

Edit comment

Delete comment

/

Procedures for acceptance of final products and processing of final payments are clearly defined by the PPL or contract law and are incorporated as standard clauses in contracts. – [1 point].

Scoring Method

Yes

O No

This indicator point: 1

Point 1 of art.36 of PPL referring to Civil and Business Codes.

Edit comment

Delete comment

61 PPL defines specific procedures for modifying contracts. – [1 point].

Scoring Method

Yes

O No

Points 4 and 5 o	art.36 of PPL.		
Edit comment	Delete comment		
			//
PPL stipulates th	nt procurement contract must include d	dispute resolution procedures. – [1 point].	
oring Method			
Yes			
) No			
	This indicator poin	nt: 1	
Regulated by Civ	il and Business Codes and Government Decre	ee #668 from 01.08.2005 (for civil works).	
Edit comment	Delete comment		
			//
PPI stinulates th	at all procurement related documentati	ion must he maintained: – [1 noint]	
-	t an procurement related documentati	on mast be maintained. [1 point].	
coring Method			
	a period of at least 10 years – [1]		
	eriod of at least 3 years – [0.5]		
None of the above –	[0]		
	This indicator poin	nt: 1	
	·		
	oint 3 of art.12 of PPL.		
Edit comment	Delete comment		
			/
			/,
		be subject to internal and external audit conducted by qua	lified
cialists. – [1 point]			
oint Distribution			

PPL stipulates that public procurement operations must be subject to internal audit conducted by qualified specialists – [0.5]
PPL stipulates that public procurement operations must be subject to external audit conducted by qualified specialists – [0.5]

This indicator point: 1

Point 3 of art.7 of PPL.

Edit comment

Delete comment



